

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission
7447 E. Indian School Road
First Floor Community Development Conference Room
May 22, 2003
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairperson
Nancy Dallett
B.J. Gonzales
Tom Lennon
Doug Sydnor
Ed Wimmer

Absent: Janet Wilson

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele, HPO

Visitors: Jimmy Eriksson, JoAnn Handley and Debbie Moore

INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members and staff present as stated above. Chairperson Johnson introduced Nancy Dallett as the newest Commission member appointed by City Council to replace Patricia Myers.

PUBLIC HEARING

3-HP-2003 Eriksson Residence Certificate of Appropriateness (Adobe Apartments Historic Property) – request by Jimmy Eriksson, owner/applicant to approve a 2-story residential addition to a 12,802 square foot historic property located at 7037-7041 E. 1st Avenue, zoned Central Business District, Historic Property (C-2 HP).

Chairperson Johnson stated the Commission would use the design guidelines from the approved Historic Preservation Plan for this property to determine whether the requested Certificate of Appropriateness should be approved for the proposed residential addition.

Ms. Abele presented this case as per the staff report.

Chairperson Johnson stated Commissioner Sydnor would not be participating in the discussion or vote as a member of the Commission because he has declared his conflict of interest as the architect for the applicant and this project. Commissioner Sydnor left the table.

Commissioner Wimmer stated he put together a matrix, which he passed out, as a way for the Commission to take notes and to organize their thoughts on the application.

Chairperson Johnson inquired if the Commission had any comments or questions regarding the impact of new construction upon character-defining features of the building complex.

Commissioner Wimmer inquired about the ramada. Mr. Eriksson stated one of the things that is lacking in the downtown area is a place for new artists to display their work. He further stated he would like to have a place where they could invite the public and help promote these artists. He noted because of the weather this area would need to be shaded. Mr. Sydnor provided information on the wooden trellises that would be constructed in the courtyard.

Chairperson Johnson requested information regarding the existing shed that would be torn down on the southeast corner of the property. She inquired if the shed was the same age as the rest of the building. Mr. Sydnor stated the shed was built after the original building.

The Commission asked a series of questions regarding the materials being proposed. Mr. Sydnor provided a review of the materials being proposed, the reason behind choosing those materials, and passed around samples of the materials.

The Commission asked a series of questions regarding the railing on the terraces and the height of the screen wall on the eastern boundary. Mr. Sydnor commented on Mr. Eriksson's concerns regarding security and the requirement to fully screen mechanical equipment on the roof.

Commission Dallett inquired if the entry gate to the residence affects the u-shaped courtyard appearance. Mr. Sydnor stated the gate will allow pedestrian access and speaks to the owner's security needs.

Chairperson Johnson stated design guideline No. 1 reads: "Alterations to the historic building should be minimized as to retain the historic scale and massing that makes the complex representative of the town's early building tradition." She remarked the scale and massing does not appear to be quite correct with the rest of the buildings.

Commissioner Wimmer stated he had the same concern regarding balance of the entire project. He further stated the horizontal windows on the north elevation seem a little strong. He inquired if it would be possible to make the second story window on the stairs on the north elevation vertical in order to have more harmony. Mr. Sydnor stated they were trying to strike a balance between the internal needs and to have a full width window. He further stated he felt there was a way to make it vertical.

The Commission discussed the dimensions of the different parts of the structures.

Chairperson Johnson expressed her concern regarding the height of the ramada and that the shape and layout take up quite a bit of space and change the open u-shape courtyard layout.

Commissioner Wimmer stated they might want to use a temporary shade structure. He suggested they restudy the alternatives to their proposed ramada. Mr. Eriksson remarked that temporary shade structures are too much of a hassle and require storage and they have limited space. He further remarked they want to have a nice place for people to sit down and with the shade structures people have the tendency to stay longer to shop. He added they want to entice people onto the property and if there is not a shade structure it will be too hot and they would walk out. Commissioner Wimmer stated he was suggesting they use something light and airy such as stringing two cables across the buildings and use canvas. He further stated he would prefer to see it up off of the ground.

Chairperson Johnson opened public testimony.

Debbie Moore, 3944 N. Marshall Way, stated she is an employee at the JW Harris building next door to the east and is attending the meeting on behalf of Mr. Harris. She remarked they felt the screen wall would block their light and views. She further remarked Mr. Harris has spent a great deal of money improving his property and had he known about this project he might have thought twice.

Chairperson Johnson closed public testimony.

Commissioner Gonzales inquired if it is a possible legal question regarding whether the wall height impacts the neighbors' view. Ms. Abele stated that issue is not under the Commission's purview. It would be part of the City's technical review to ensure that height is allowed under the zoning and it has been determined that the wall meets zoning requirements.

Commissioner Lennon moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the Eriksson Residence project as submitted with reference to how the project meets the guidelines. Seconded by Commissioner Gonzales.

Chairperson Johnson stated she would request to amend the motion with the following two changes:

- Change the shape of the windows on the north elevation subject to staff approval.
- The ramada design is resubmitted.

The motion and second stated they would agree to those amendments. Commissioner Wimmer requested the applicant work with the neighbors to mitigate some of the issues regarding the massive wall.

Ms. Abele stated for clarification that with this motion the Commission is approving a Certificate of Appropriateness excluding the ramada.

The motion passed by a vote of five (5) to zero (0) with Commissioner Sydnor not voting.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

Discussion: May 8th Public Meeting on Downtown Survey Results and Prospective Register Properties.

Chairperson Johnson stated the record should reflect that Commissioner Sydnor is rejoining the Commission at the table.

Mr. Meserve stated they did not have the turnout they wanted in part because of the special reception for the Mayor Drinkwater statue that was occurring at the same time as the open house.

Ms. Abele stated she and Mr. Meserve made a concerted effort to contact the downtown property owners and interested citizens to invite them to this meeting.

JoAnn Handley, Scottsdale Historical Society representative, stated they are not going to get the shop owners to attend unless it directly affects them because they are too tied up in their businesses. She further stated that most people just want to go home at night.

Commissioner Dallett stated they might want to consider piggy backing with another event that the property owners are already attending.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Mr. Meserve stated the Statewide Historic Preservation Partnership Conference will be held on June 26th-28 2003 at the historic San Marcos Hotel in Chandler, Arizona. Staff submitted a request to the State regarding splitting the cost of attending the conference and the State has approved funding for 60 percent (\$45) of the cost for Commissioners. He noted staff would determine soon if there is any City money to assist them with the rest of the conference registration fee (\$30).

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairperson Johnson stated the next Historic Register Committee meeting is scheduled for June 18th at which time participants are being asked to report on their integrity ratings for 1950s neighborhoods under review.

Chairperson Johnson announced that Liz Wilson, who works as an assistant to Debbie Abele, has been appointed to the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission. Chairperson Johnson stated the three Commissions, Scottsdale, Tempe, and Mesa, would be meeting jointly to discuss preservation issues.

SUMMER MEETING SCHEDULE

Chairperson Johnson stated the next Commission meeting is June 12, 2003 and they would not meet on June 26th. It was determined the Commission would not meet in July or the beginning of August and would hold a training session on August 28th, the fourth Thursday of the month.

Meeting adjourned at 6:50 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters